

The main scholarship that I will be using in my research is from authors, Caesar Lambroso, Wilfred Hambly, Albert Parry, Steve Gilbert, Greg Denning, Margot DeMello, Margot Mifflin, June Namias, Robert Allan, Alfred Gell, and Amelia Osterud. A variety of other scholarship will be employed while discussing my topics, but these authors most directly address major themes in my research.

The primary sources I will be using are travel journals, newspapers, advertisements, captivity narratives, paintings, sculptures, and early-twentieth century scholarly work.

Annotated Bibliography:

Newspaper Articles

"A Marvel of Tattooing." *Democratic Advocate* (Westminster, Md.), June 17, 1876.

"A Marvel of Tattooing." *Port Royal Standard and Commercial* (Port Royal, SC.), June 29, 1876.

"A Marvel of Tattooing." *The Sun* (New York City), May 28, 1876.

"A Thrilling Story: Ten Years with the Savages of the Far West..." *New York Times*, Dec 11, 1871.

"American Museum." *New-York Daily Tribune*, November 25, 1842.

"Barnum Show To-Morrow." *The Wheeling Daily Intelligencer* (Wheeling W. VA.), September 12, 1878.

"Barnum's Big Show." *The State Journal* (Jefferson City, MO), Sept. 21, 1877.

"Bowery Amphitheater." *New York Herald*, January 15, 1845.

"British Burlesque Again." *New York Times*, Jun 9, 1869.

"Cannibals in San Francisco." *Fayette County Herald* (Fayette County, Ohio), Jan 15, 1880,

"Elysian Fields." *New York Herald*, July 08, 1845.

"Fashion." *Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science and Art*, vol. 01, no. 1 (January 1853):
68-76.

"Former Savages are Voters." *Abbeville Progress* (Abbeville, Vermilion Parish, La.), Oct 10, 1914.

"Franklin Theater." *New York Herald*, October 21, 1849.

"From the African Squadron: The U.S. Navy Coast-Guarders in..." *New York Times*, Mar. 9 1859.

"Holden's Narrative." *The North American Review*, vol. 43, no. 92 (July 1836): 222.

"Manners and Customs of Primitive Indian Tribes." *The North American Review*, vol. 101, no. 208 (July 1865):
28-65.

"Maori Tattooing." *Stephens City Star* (Stephens City, VA.). Feb 25, 1882.

"Mr. O'Connell, The Tattooed Man." *New York Herald*, November 23, 1842.

"Mr. P. T. Barnum's New and Only Greatest Show on Earth." *The Grange Advance*, (Red Wing, Minn), July 11,
1877.

"New and Greatest Show on Earth." *The Sedalia Weekly Bazoo* (Sedalia, Mo.), September 18, 1877.

"New and Only Greatest Show on Earth." *The State Journal* (Jefferson City, Mo.), September 21, 1877.

"New Zealand." *The North American Review*, vol. 8, no. 43 (April 1824): 347.

"Races That Now Tattoo: Barbarous People Not Alone Addicted To It." *New York Times*, Dec. 26, 1881.

"Six Years' Captivity Among the Indians Narrative of Miss Olive Oatman." *New York Times*, May 4, 1858.

"Slain by Borneo Savages: Mr. Witt's Sad Fortunes in the Land of the Head Hunters." *New York Times*, Oct 30,
1882.

"Some Curious People." *Barbour County Index* (Medicine Lodge, Kan.), May 14, 1886.

"Suffering to be Beautiful." *New York Times*, Jul 24, 1887.

"Suffering to be Beautiful." *New York Times*, Jul 24, 1887.

"Tattooing Confined Criminals." *Evening Bulletin* (Washington D.C.), July 12, 1882.

"Tattooing in New York: A Visit Paid to the Artist." *New York Times*, Jan 16, 1876.

"Tattooing in New Zealand." *New York Times*, Jan 25, 1874.

"Tattooing, The Way in Which the Orientals Perform the Practice." *The Cambria Freeman* (Ebensburg, P.A.),
Feb. 22, 1889.

"Tattooing." *New York Times*, Jan 30, 1880.

"Tattooing." *Press and Tribune* (Chicago, IL.), Oct. 22, 1860.

"Tattooing: One of the Singular Industries in the Metropolis." *The Opelousas Courier* (Opelousas, La.),
November 27, 1886.

"The Battle of the Blondes." *New York Times*, Nov 16, 1869.

"The Bloodthirsty Head Hunters of Samoa." *The New York Journal*, (New York City, NY), April 11, 1889.

"The Burlesque Madness." *New York Times*, Feb 5, 1869.

"The Dandy Chastised." *Southern Literary Messenger*, vol. 1, no. 3, (Nov 1834): 96.

"The Instinctive Love of Dress." *New York Times*, Feb 19, 1888.

"The Latest Folly." *Daily Globe* (St. Paul, Minn.), October 26, 1879.

"The Tattooed Greek Nobleman." *The Cincinnati Daily Star*, October 06, 1877,

"The Tattooed Lady." *Evening Star* (Washington D.C.), October 11, 1884.

"The Tattooed Man." *The Tattooed Man* - Victor Herbert.

http://www.guidetomusicaltheatre.com/shows_t/TattooedMan.html. Accessed Sep 27, 2017. "The
Victim of Tattoo." *Pacific Commercial Advertiser* (Honolulu, Hawaii), Jan 09, 1885.

"Typee." *The American Whig Review*, vol. 3, no 4 (April 1846): 420.

These newspaper articles and advertisements show how tattooing was discussed in popular media around the country, they show how circus sideshows presented tattooing as a form of savage torture, and they show a change in the way tattooing was discussed in the media before and after tattooing was popularized by the circus. This set of sources will be most valuable to my work. Captivity narratives and paintings that depict captivity narratives will be invaluable to my work as it is these sources that influence the stories that tattooed men told on stage.

Travel Journals

Banks, Joseph. "Extracts from the Endeavour Journal of Joseph Banks." The Public Domain Review.

<https://publicdomainreview.org/collections/extracts-from-the-endeavour-journal-of-joseph-banks-1769/>. Accessed Sept. 27, 2017.

Cook, James. *A Journal of a Voyage Round the World in H.M.S. Endeavor 1768-1771*. London: Printed for J.

Langsdorff, Georg H. Von. *Voyages and Travels in Various Parts of the World*. London, 1813. Reprinted in Steve Gilbert's *Tattoo History: A Sourcebook*. 140

The travel journals provide the first examples of Europeans discussing tattooing among the Polynesian peoples, thereby establishing foundational language people would use when discussing the art form.

Captivity Narratives and Paintings

John Mix Stanley. *Osage Scalp Dance*, Oil on Canvas, 1845.

Canot, Pierre Charles, "The Indians delivering up the English captives to Colonel Bouquet near his camp at the forks of Muskingum in North America in Novr. 1764 / B. West invt. ; sculp." *Archive Materials*, accessed August 28, 2017.

Howard, Frank. *The Life of Frank Howard, The Most Wonderfully Tattooed Man in the Civilized [sic] World*. New York Pop. Publishing Company, 1880.

Konstantinus, Georg. *The true life and adventures of Captain Costentenus, the tattooed Greek prince, written by himself, and translated from the original Romaic by Professor Demitri, of Athens*. New York Popular Publishing Co, New York. 1881.

O'Connell, James. *The Life and Adventures of James F. O'Connell, The Tattooed Man*. New York, NY: W. Applegate, 1845.

Rowlandson, Mary. *A Narrative of Captivity, Sufferings, and Removes of Mrs. Mary Rowlandson*. Thomas and Fleet, 1791. <https://archive.org/stream/narrativeofcapti00inrowl#page/n5/mode/2up>.

Stearns, Junius Brutus. "Hannah Duston Killing the Indians," oil on canvas; 1847.

Stevenson, Robert Louis; Osbourne, Lloyd. "The Wrecker." *Scribner's Magazine*, vol. 10, no. 2 (August, 1891): 171-194.

Stratton, Royal B. "Horrid Death of the Indian Captive," woodblock print, 1857.

Stratton, Royal B. "The Murder of the Oatman Family," woodblock print; 1857.

Tattooing of O'Connell and Keenan, c.1855, print. Accessed via

<http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/2002710368/>.

Vanderlyn, John. "The Murder of Jane McCrea." Oil on Canvas, 1804.

Wimar, Charles. "The Abduction of Daniel Boone's Daughter by the Indians." Oil on Canvas. 1853.

Hawkesworth, John. "Maori Tattoo," London, 1773. Accessed via Getty Images.

<http://www.gettyimages.com/detail/news-photo/antique-print-of-a-maori-man-with-ta-moko-tattoos-recorded-news-photo/530211657#antique-print-of-a-maori-man-with-ta-moko-tattoos-recorded-during-the-picture-id530211657>. Accessed Sep. 27, 2017.

These sources are grouped together as captivity narratives and images that were included in the narratives, or images that depict certain captivity narratives. Captivity narratives can be found in American literary culture from the beginning of Euro-American colonization of North America, and these stories of captivity among the "savages" provided a convenient formula that was later employed by tattooed sideshows. The paintings that depict these events will be useful for two reasons: one, the advertisements for circus sideshows are suspiciously similar to famous paintings of captivity, and many of the paintings are from the eighteen fifties, decades after the events that they depict happened. The fact that Euro-Americans were memorializing old captivity stories such a long time after they allegedly happened, not to mention the way they

depict Native Americans as dangerous barbarians, supports the idea that these images and stories were used as propaganda to validate Euro-Americans subjugation of indigenous peoples.

20th Century Scholarly Work

Hambly, Wilfrid. *The History of Tattooing*. Mineola, NY: Dover Books, 2009.

Lombroso, Cesare. *Criminal Man*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2006.

Parry, Albert. *Tattoo: Secrets of a Strange Art*. Mineola, NY: Dover Publications, 2006.

Robley, Horatio. *Maori Tattooing*. Dover Publications, New York, originally published in 1896.

These scholarly works from the twentieth century will be important to my work because the early work of historians and anthropologists on the topic of tattooing show that the language and opinions that characterized the way tattoos were discussed in nineteenth century newspapers subsequently made its way into scholarly work. These pieces of scholarship, therefore, exemplify the creation of an American discourse on tattooing.

Secondary Sources

The subject of tattooing among Western Europeans and Americans was approached by a few other scholars during the mid-twentieth century which served to further build upon the foundational ideas connect tattooing to mental disorders and criminality, however, the argument noting *how* tattooing became understood as a negative act by Western society was first approached by Historian/Anthropologist Greg Dening in his work *Islands and Beaches*:

Discourses of a Silent Land, published in 1980. Denning argues that early sailors received tattoos as a way to assimilate or communicate peace with the Native peoples of the Polynesian islands, however, when they returned home the tattoo communicated something different: the men returning home with tattoos brought with them a permanent example of a white man accepting a “savage” culture. Thus, Denning argues, many of the men made up stories about being tattooed against their will in order to escape the embarrassment of admitting that they had “gone native.” Unlike earlier scholars, Denning notes possible reasons for the creation of captivity and torture stories and makes the logical assumption that tattooing became associated with otherness because they communicated that the individual with tattoos was different than what was acceptable to contemporary American standards.

The topic of tattooing among the Polynesian people was revolutionized in 1993 with Alfred Gell’s *Wrapping in Images*. In *Wrapping in Images*, Gell deeply explores the meaning of tattoos in the socio-political-religious institutions of Polynesian society at the time of contact between the Polynesian Islands and the Western voyagers. However, Gell contextualizes his study by discussing why he thinks that the tattoo got such a bad connotation in American society during the twentieth century. For Gell, Lombroso’s connection between criminality and tattooing was the main factor in American perceptions of tattooing. Gell admits that Lombroso’s work was remarking on a correlation that was undeniable, criminals are often tattooed, but Gell argues that Lombroso’s assumptions were overstating bad science as fact. Gell offers more context and nuance with regard to tattooing in Western society, arguing that the negative connotation surrounding tattooing was a result of class politics in which the lower

class was more likely to be tattooed, and, thus, it was seen as something “civilized” people did not do.

A quite different approach to the history of tattooing was undertaken by author Margot Mifflin in her 1997 publication *Bodies of Subversion*. Mifflin, who also wrote a book on Olive Oatman, (America’s first tattooed captive) takes a feminist approach to the history of tattooing focusing on tattooed women in the late nineteenth century. Mifflin’s work argues that trailblazing women in this time period subverted the masculine art of tattoo and made their way in the man’s world of tattooed sideshows. For Mifflin, the tattoo got its masculine reputation through its prevalence among sailors and sideshow men, and her work is invaluable in its focus on the social mores and cultural meaning that women had to overcome in order to normalize tattooing among women.

The most direct discussion regarding how tattooing became associated with negative acts undertaken by sailors and criminals was Margo DeMello’s *Bodies of Inscription*, published in 2000. DeMello’s work follows the American discourse regarding tattooing from its beginnings in the nineteenth century up to the nineteen nineties. Throughout her work, DeMello traces the various iterations that caused changes in the way tattoos were perceived by American society throughout the twentieth century. *Bodies of Inscription* is a convincing piece of scholarship in which DeMello’s argues that tattooing was first an act of inclusion among sailors and military personnel, but over time the practice was appropriated by criminals for similar reasons: inclusion into a group. DeMello’s arguments are much in line with the points I will be making, however, her work does not focus on major institutions that facilitated

tattooing's reputation American popular culture, nor does she discuss how tattooing originally gained its unsavory reputation.